

**EXHIBIT #4**

52556050-361

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

RECEIVED  
FEB 28 2008

-----  
RASHAD ALI, MINERVA ALI, MINERVA ALI AS  
GUARDIAN OVER DANYAL ALI, INFANT MINERVA ALI,  
AS GUARDIAN OVER TANYAH ALI, INFANT,

KELLY, RODE & KELLY, LLP

Plaintiffs,

Docket No.

07 CV 6010

-against-

(GBD)

LECOURIUX G. YANNICK,

Defendant.

-----x  
EXAMINATION BEFORE TRIAL of the  
Plaintiff, MINERVA ALI, taken by the Defendant,  
pursuant to Order, held at the offices of Sacks  
& Sacks, LLP, 150 Broadway, New York, New York,  
on February 8, 2008, at 1:13 p.m., before a  
Notary Public of the State of New York.

\*\*\*\*\*

BARRISTER REPORTING SERVICE, INC.

120 Broadway

New York, N.Y. 10271

212-732-8066

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

A P P E A R A N C E S :

SACKS & SACKS, LLP

Attorneys for Plaintiffs  
150 Broadway  
New York, New York 10038

BY: DAVID H. MAYER, ESQ.

KELLY, RODE & KELLY

Attorneys for Defendant  
330 Old Country Road  
Mineola, New York 11501

BY: JOHN MORRIS, ESQ.

XXXXXX

1

2

S T I P U L A T I O N S

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED AND AGREED by and

between the attorneys for the respective parties

herein, that filing, sealing and certification, be

and the same are, hereby waived.

IT IS FURTHER STIPULATED AND AGREED that

all objections except as to the form of the

question, shall be reserved to the time of the

trial.

IT IS FURTHER STIPULATED AND AGREED that

the within deposition may be signed and sworn to

by an officer authorized to administer an oath,

with the same force and effect as if signed and

sworn to before the Court.

xxxxxx

1

2 M I N E R V A A L I,

3 having been first duly sworn before a

4 Notary Public of the State of New

5 York, was examined and testified as

6 follows:

7

8 EXAMINATION BY

9 MR. MORRIS:

10 Q. Please state your name for the record.

11 A. Minerva Ali.

12 Q. What is your address?

13 A. 1255 Ward Avenue, first floor, Bronx,

14 New York 10472.

15 Q. Good afternoon, Mrs. Ali. My name is

16 John Morris. I'm an attorney. I represent

17 the defendant, Mr. Yannick, in this lawsuit

18 that has been brought on your behalf by your

19 attorneys. I am going to ask you some

20 questions about an automobile accident that

21 you were involved in and some related

22 matters.

23 If there is any question you don't

24 understand, it could always be read back by

25 the court reporter. If is not clear, we

1 M. Ali  
2 could try another question. Please,  
3 verbalize all your responses, because if you  
4 shake your head or make a hand gesture, that  
5 cannot be taken down by the court reporter.  
6 We need the court reporter to take down  
7 everything that's being said and the  
8 questions and the answers. Also, please,  
9 wait until I'm done with my question before  
10 you start to answer so that the court  
11 reporter can take down all the words that are  
12 being said. Okay, ma'am?  
13 A. Yes.  
14 Q. Ma'am, what is your date of birth?  
15 A. April 2, 1983.  
16 Q. Have you ever been known by other  
17 names besides Minerva Ali?  
18 A. Yes, Machuca, M-A-C-H-U-C-A.  
19 Q. Was that your maiden name?  
20 A. That's -- Ali is my married last name.  
21 That's my own last name.  
22 Q. What is your height?  
23 A. 5'5''.  
24 Q. Approximate weight?  
25 A. 170.

1 M. Ali

2 Q. Where were you born, ma'am?

3 A. San Juan, Puerto Rico.

4 Q. When did you come to the mainland,  
5 United States?

6 A. 2001.

7 Q. Are you married?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. Your husband's name is?

10 A. Rashad Ali.

11 Q. The date of your marriage is?

12 A. By religion, December 6th.

13 Q. Of what year?

14 A. 2001.

15 Q. I guess in front of the court is  
16 another date?

17 A. Yes. That is -- was -- I don't know  
18 the date. The year, 2003.

19 Q. Ma'am, I see you're wearing glasses  
20 right now. That is for nearsightedness?

21 A. Yeah.

22 Q. When you're wearing your glasses, do  
23 you then have good vision?

24 A. No.

25 Q. I mean, if you're wearing your

1 M. Ali  
2 glasses, can you see fine?  
3 A. Yes, I can see.  
4 Q. Any problems with your hearing?  
5 A. No.  
6 Q. Ma'am, you have three children; is  
7 that correct?  
8 A. Yes.  
9 Q. That is Danyal, Danyah and Tanyah?  
10 A. Yes.  
11 Q. How long have you lived at 1255 Ward  
12 Avenue in the Bronx on the first floor?  
13 A. Since I married.  
14 Q. When you say since you married, do you  
15 mean the 2001 or 2003 date?  
16 A. No, the 2001.  
17 Q. Ma'am, do you remember being involved  
18 in a motor vehicle accident which is the  
19 subject of this lawsuit?  
20 A. Yes.  
21 Q. What's the date of that accident?  
22 A. 10/28/06.  
23 Q. At the time of the accident, was your  
24 husband driving?  
25 A. Yes.



1 M. Ali

2 Q. Were you a front seat passenger?

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. It was in your husband's silver 2002  
5 Honda Civic?

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. Your three children were in the back  
8 seat at the time?

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. They were properly in their car seats?

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. Did that front passenger's seat of  
13 your husband's car have a safety belt at the  
14 time of the accident?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. Were you wearing a safety belt?

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. To the best of your knowledge, did the  
19 safety belt work at the time of the accident?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. Where were you coming from at the time  
22 of the accident?

23 A. Shopping in New Jersey.

24 Q. Was your husband driving home at the  
25 time of the accident?

1 M. Ali

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. What were the weather conditions like  
4 at the time of the accident?

5 A. Cloudy.

6 Q. Were the roadways, basically, dry?

7 MR. MAYER: Note my objection to  
8 form. You could answer.

9 Q. Was the roadway dry at the location of  
10 the accident?

11 A. At the time the accident happened?

12 Q. Yes.

13 A. It was dry.

14 Q. Had your husband been driving on the  
15 FDR Drive before the accident?

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. He was going to drive you and the rest  
18 of your family home?

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. Where did the accident happen?

21 A. Exiting out from the FDR.

22 Q. Exiting out from the FDR Drive?

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. Do you remember what exit it was at?

25 A. No.

1 M. Ali

2 Q. Ma'am, have you ever been a licensed  
3 driver?

4 A. No.

5 Q. How were you first made aware that  
6 there was an accident?

7 A. When he hit us.

8 Q. Did you have any indication before the  
9 contact that an accident was about to occur?

10 A. No.

11 Q. By that I mean, did you hear any  
12 screeching of tires, screeching of brakes,  
13 any horns honking, anything like that?

14 A. No, I don't know.

15 Q. You are very soft spoken. Just a  
16 little louder.

17 A. Sorry.

18 Q. That's okay. Was there one other  
19 vehicle involved in this accident?

20 A. The guy that hit us.

21 Q. No other vehicle?

22 A. No.

23 Q. So, it's your vehicle and this other  
24 guy and he was in a Jeep, if you remember?

25 A. I think.

1 M. Ali

2 Q. What color was the other car?

3 A. I don't know.

4 Q. To the best of your knowledge, did  
5 this other vehicle hit your husband's car?

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. Immediately before this other vehicle  
8 made contact with your vehicle, was your  
9 vehicle stopped or was it moving at that  
10 time?

11 A. I don't remember.

12 Q. What were you doing immediately before  
13 the accident?

14 A. Cry.

15 Q. Immediately before the accident?

16 A. Before?

17 Q. Immediately before?

18 A. I was looking everywhere.

19 Q. Were your children pretty quiet before  
20 the accident or causing some problems for you  
21 or something else?

22 A. No, they were quiet.

23 Q. This other vehicle that was in this  
24 accident, did it hit your husband's car from  
25 behind?

1 M. Ali

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. Do you know if it pushed your vehicle  
4 forward?

5 A. I don't know.

6 Q. Was it one impact or more than one  
7 impact?

8 A. One.

9 Q. As a result of this one impact, did  
10 any parts of your body make contact with any  
11 portion of the interior of the car?

12 A. No.

13 Q. Did your seat break as a result of the  
14 accident?

15 A. No.

16 Q. Did your seat belt break as a result  
17 of the accident?

18 A. No.

19 Q. Do you know what an air bag is in a  
20 car?

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. Did any air bags open up inside your  
23 husband's car as a result of this accident?

24 A. No, no.

25 Q. After the accident, did both your

1 M. Ali

2 husband's and the vehicle behind you pull  
3 over to the left side of the road?

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. Did you hear the driver of the other  
6 vehicle say anything to your husband at  
7 anytime?

8 A. I hear he say something. I don't know  
9 what.

10 Q. Ma'am, your first language is Spanish?

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. Do you have any problem understanding  
13 the English language so far in our questions  
14 and answering?

15 A. No. Pronouncing.

16 Q. I will go slower if you need.

17 MR. MORRIS: I'm sorry, could I  
18 have that answer read back?

19 (Whereupon the record was read  
20 back by the reporter.)

21 Q. Do you have any recollection of what  
22 the driver of this other car said to your  
23 husband at the scene?

24 A. No.

25 Q. Ma'am, is it that you don't remember

1 M. Ali

2 or you didn't understand what he was saying  
3 or is it something else?

4 A. I don't remember if I don't remember  
5 or I don't understand.

6 Q. What is the first thing you said after  
7 the accident?

8 A. That I said?

9 Q. Yes.

10 A. Oh, my God.

11 Q. Did your husband then ask you how you  
12 were feeling or if you were okay, in some  
13 words like that?

14 A. Yes. After I just said, oh, my God.  
15 Right in the same instance I started crying  
16 and after he saw me crying then he asked me.

17 Q. He asked you how were you feeling?

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. Were you feeling pain in any part of  
20 your body immediately after the accident?

21 A. Immediately.

22 Q. While you were still --

23 A. Five minutes after.

24 Q. Within five minutes of the accident,  
25 you were feeling pain in some part of your

1 M. Ali

2 body?

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. Where?

5 A. It started from up my neck down  
6 through my whole hand, my arm.

7 Q. So, are you indicating the back and  
8 the side of your neck, one particular side?  
9 Is it one side or the other? Are you  
10 indicating the left side?

11 A. In the left side.

12 Q. So, the left side of your neck, the  
13 left side of the back of your neck? You are  
14 indicating it's going down to your shoulder?

15 A. Back of my shoulder and my arm.

16 Q. All this is the left side of your  
17 body?

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. You indicated in the back of your left  
20 shoulder. What about the front of your  
21 shoulder?

22 A. The front on the left side?

23 Q. Yes. Did you feel anything there that  
24 felt unusual?

25 A. I cannot remember.



1 M. Ali

2 Q. Did you feel pain in any other part of  
3 your body at that time?

4 A. That time right away.

5 Q. While you were still at the scene of  
6 the accident?

7 A. Yeah, it start like more in my column.

8 Q. You are indicating the lower back,  
9 basically?

10 A. Yes, around the middle.

11 Q. Did the police arrive on the scene?

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. Did you speak to the police?

14 A. No.

15 Q. Did they attempt to speak to you?

16 A. No.

17 Q. Did you hear them speaking to the  
18 other driver?

19 A. I don't remember.

20 Q. Please, describe that other driver,  
21 was it male?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. What else can you say about the  
24 person?

25 A. Caucasian.

1 M. Ali

2 Q. Approximate age?

3 A. I don't know. Something like you.

4 Q. Did the police ask you, at any time,  
5 how you were feeling?

6 MR. MAYER: Note my objection to  
7 the form. I think you asked that.

8 A. I don't think -- I don't recall it.

9 Q. Did an ambulance arrive on the scene?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. Did anyone from the ambulance speak to  
12 you?

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. What did they say to you and what did  
15 you say to them?

16 A. They first asked me if I was okay and  
17 they asked me, before going into the  
18 ambulance, they are going to have do an  
19 evaluation.

20 Q. When they asked you were you okay, did  
21 you respond?

22 A. Yes, I told them.

23 Q. What did you tell them?

24 A. That I have pain.

25 Q. Did you tell them what part of your

1 M. Ali

2 body?

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. So, did you use words and also  
5 indicate by hand gestures?

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. You told them you had pain in your  
8 neck and going down your left arm?

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. Did you then go inside the ambulance?

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. What did they do for you in there?

13 A. They check my blood pressure, they  
14 asked me about, you know, where I was born  
15 and the usual -- what the doctor's ask  
16 previous.

17 Q. Did they put you in a neck brace?

18 A. No.

19 Q. Did you get out of your husband's car  
20 by yourself?

21 A. The guys in the ambulance helped me.

22 Q. Did they help you and walk you over to  
23 the ambulance or did they put you on a  
24 stretcher?

25 A. They walked me over to the ambulance.

1 M. Ali

2 Q. What was being done, if anything, with  
3 your children at that time?

4 A. They evaluated them.

5 Q. Did your children also get in the  
6 ambulance?

7 A. No.

8 Q. Did the children remain in the car?

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. Did any of the ambulance personnel  
11 give you a diagnosis?

12 A. No.

13 Q. Did you have some discussion with them  
14 about going to the hospital?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. What was that discussion?

17 A. They said I should go to the hospital.  
18 Because of the situation with the kids, I  
19 refused. I said, I'm going to go, you  
20 know --

21 Q. You are going to go with your husband  
22 later?

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. Did the ambulance personnel evaluate  
25 your children?

1 M. Ali

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. At some point, did you and your  
4 husband get back in your husband's car?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. Then he drove home?

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. He dropped off your groceries?

9 A. Just, like, milk.

10 Q. The perishable ones?

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. Then, what happened next, what did he  
13 do?

14 A. Well, he called to the job saying he  
15 couldn't go and we're going to the doctor.

16 Q. What is the first place you went to,  
17 you said the doctor?

18 A. New York Presbyterian.

19 Q. So, your first medical treatment after  
20 the ambulance was --

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. -- at New York Presbyterian Hospital?

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. Did you know anybody who worked there  
25 at the time?

1 M. Ali

2 A. No.

3 Q. Was it your choice to go to that  
4 hospital as opposed to your husband or was it  
5 a joint decision?

6 A. We both decided together.

7 Q. So, your husband then drove you and  
8 your three children to the hospital?

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. How long did you have to wait in the  
11 emergency room before any of you received any  
12 examination or care?

13 A. Before the doctor called us?

14 Q. Yes, before they looked at you. Not  
15 just filling out paperwork. Someone actually  
16 examined you or treated you, how long was  
17 that?

18 A. I don't remember.

19 Q. Was it a matter of hours?

20 A. I don't know.

21 Q. Ma'am, at the time of this accident,  
22 were you employed outside the home?

23 A. No.

24 Q. Were you a homemaker at the time of  
25 this accident?

1 M. Ali

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. You took care of your three children  
4 at this time?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. Before this accident, did you cook all  
7 the family members meals?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. After your visit to the hospital, did  
10 your husband then drive you and your children  
11 back home?

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. Do you remember about what time of day  
14 it was that you actually got back home after  
15 the hospital visit?

16 A. No.

17 Q. Was it in the evening by that time?

18 A. I don't remember.

19 Q. What time did the accident occur?

20 A. Half day, like half day 12:00 to 1:00.

21 Q. Noon to 1:00, somewhere around that  
22 time, somewhere around lunchtime?

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. When was the first time you received  
25 any medical examination, treatment or care

1 M. Ali

2 after the emergency room?

3 A. Like, a week after.

4 Q. Where did you go?

5 A. Castle Hill.

6 Q. That is the same facility that your  
7 husband went to?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. Did you and your husband go together  
10 on your first visit?

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. Was that also, if you know, his first  
13 visit at that time? Was it the first visit  
14 for both of you?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. Were you examined in the presence of  
17 your husband?

18 A. No.

19 Q. Was he examined in your presence?

20 A. No.

21 Q. What complaints, if any, did you make  
22 to them at Castle Hill about how you were  
23 feeling?

24 A. Pain in my neck, my left arm, like my  
25 upper back, lower back, lower around my hips.



1 M. Ali

2 Q. Between the time of the emergency room  
3 visit and your first visit to Castle Hill,  
4 what happened to the level of pain you were  
5 feeling; did it stay the same, get better,  
6 get worse?

7 A. Could you repeat the question?

8 MR. MORRIS: Read back the  
9 question.

10 (Whereupon the record was read  
11 back by the reporter.)

12 A. I'm lost, sorry.

13 Q. That's okay. In that approximate one  
14 week between the time of your emergency room  
15 visit and the first visit to Castle Hill, the  
16 pain that you had in your body, was it  
17 getting better, worse or staying the same?

18 A. It was going worse.

19 Q. Do you remember the name of any of  
20 your doctors at Castle Hill?

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. What were the names?

23 A. Manta.

24 MR. MORRIS: Do you have the  
25 spelling of that?

1 M. Ali

2 MR. MAYER: M-A-N-T-A.

3 Q. Man or woman?

4 A. Woman.

5 Q. Manta was the last name?

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. Do you know if that was the same  
8 doctor that examined your husband?

9 A. No.

10 Q. Was it a different doctor?

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. Do you know the names of any of the  
13 doctors at Castle Hill?

14 A. What other doctors?

15 Q. Were there other doctors who examined  
16 you or treated you at Castle Hill?

17 A. No.

18 Q. On that first visit to Castle Hill,  
19 did the doctor take a history from you?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. Ask you about the accident?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. Did she ask whether you already had an  
24 injury to your neck, left arm or back before?

25 A. I don't remember.

1 M. Ali

2 Q. Besides examining you, did Dr. Manta  
3 setup a course of treatment for you?

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. What is the course offer treatment she  
6 setup?

7 A. Massage, electric stimulations and hot  
8 towels. This hot thing, I don't know what  
9 you call it.

10 Q. Is it something different from the  
11 massager or was that a massager?

12 A. Yes, it is like a hot thing they put  
13 in your back.

14 Q. Something like a heating pad?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. Some type of moist heat was applied to  
17 your back?

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. For how long did you receive these  
20 treatments?

21 A. Couple months.

22 Q. Couple months, what do you mean?

23 A. Because I know it's months, but I  
24 don't remember how long.

25 Q. Your best approximation in terms of

1 M. Ali

2 the number. Was it more than three months,  
3 less than three months, about three months?

4 A. I think more than months.

5 Q. More than three months, less than five  
6 months?

7 A. I don't know.

8 Q. Fair to say sometime between three and  
9 six months?

10 A. I really don't remember.

11 Q. I'm just trying to establish the outer  
12 limit? Was it more than three months, was it  
13 less than a year?

14 A. Less than a year.

15 Q. The treatment you received over that  
16 time, did they pretty much consist of the  
17 same treatments throughout?

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. With what frequency in a week would  
20 you go?

21 A. Four or five.

22 Q. Did you go at the same time that your  
23 husband went?

24 A. Sometimes.

25 Q. On those occasions when you went with

1 M. Ali

2 your husband, did your husband drive you  
3 there?

4 A. We go with the train.

5 Q. How far was Castle Hill from your  
6 home?

7 A. Not far.

8 Q. Approximately?

9 A. Like, three stops from the train.

10 Q. Did you find that the different  
11 treatments that you received, the massage,  
12 the electric stimulations and the moist heat,  
13 did that make you feel better?

14 A. At the moment.

15 Q. Besides giving you these treatments,  
16 did Dr. Manta send you for any other kinds of  
17 treatments or diagnostic testing?

18 A. I'm sorry, can I hear that again?

19 MR. MORRIS: Strike that  
20 question. I'm going to ask a new  
21 question.

22 Q. Besides Dr. Manta sending you for this  
23 physical therapy, these massages and  
24 electrical stimulation and heat, did Dr.  
25 Manta send you for any other kind of

1 M. Ali

2 treatment or examination or diagnosis?

3 A. I'm sorry, repeat it again.

4 (Whereupon the record was read  
5 back by the reporter.)

6 A. Examination. She sent me for an x-ray  
7 and MRI.

8 Q. Now, the x-rays, were the x-rays taken  
9 at Castle Hill or elsewhere?

10 A. Elsewhere.

11 Q. She also sent you for MRIs?

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. Were the x-rays and MRIs taken at the  
14 same place?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. Were x-rays and MRIs taken on one  
17 occasion or more than one occasion?

18 A. More than one.

19 Q. How many visits all together?

20 A. I think three.

21 Q. Three occasions?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. What parts of your body were x-rayed  
24 and MRId?

25 A. My neck and my lower back.

1 M. Ali

2 Q. Do you remember the name of the MRI  
3 and x-ray facility?

4 A. No.

5 Q. Do you remember what street it was on?

6 A. I don't.

7 Q. Do you remember a facility by the name  
8 of Aviva, A-V-I-V-A, Medical Imaging at 205  
9 Williamsbridge Road in the Bronx?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. Was that where it was, Williamsbridge  
12 Road?

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. Ma'am, before this accident of October  
15 28, 2006, had you ever had any x-rays taken  
16 of your neck?

17 A. X-ray before?

18 Q. Yes.

19 A. No.

20 Q. Before the accident of October 28,  
21 2006, had you ever had any x-rays taken of  
22 your back?

23 A. No.

24 Q. Before the accident of October 28,  
25 2006, had you ever had an MRI taken of your

1 M. Ali

2 neck?

3 A. No.

4 Q. Before the accident of October 28,  
5 2006, had you ever had an MRI taken of your  
6 lower back?

7 A. No.

8 Q. Had you ever been to a chiropractor  
9 before the accident of October 28, 2006?

10 A. No.

11 Q. Before the accident of October 28,  
12 2006, had you ever experienced neck pain?

13 A. Before the accident?

14 Q. Yes, before this accident.

15 A. No.

16 Q. Before this accident, had you ever  
17 experienced lower back pain?

18 A. No.

19 Q. Had you received any medical  
20 examination, treatment or care for your neck  
21 or your back before this accident?

22 A. No.

23 Q. Did Dr. Manta send you for any other  
24 examination, diagnosis, treatment or care?

25 A. No.



1 M. Ali

2 Q. Did any doctor ever recommend to you  
3 any kind of injections?

4 A. After?

5 Q. In other words, for the injuries you  
6 suffered in this accident?

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. Did you have them?

9 A. They gave me injections.

10 Q. Where were these injections, where on  
11 your body were these injections?

12 A. Lower back. It was at the same time.

13 Q. The same time as your husband?

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. Did you also go to Dr. Merola?

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. Did you go to Dr. Merola at the same  
18 time that your husband went?

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. You were getting your own course of  
21 treatment from Dr. Merola, separate from him;  
22 is that correct?

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. Did Dr. Merola send you for another  
25 doctor to get injections to your lower back?

1 M. Ali

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. What is the other doctor's name?

4 A. I don't know.

5 Q. Do you remember where that doctor's  
6 office was located?

7 A. Manhattan.

8 Q. Dr. Merola's office is also in  
9 Manhattan?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. Do you know whether that other doctor  
12 was in the same building as Dr. Merola or  
13 somewhere else?

14 A. Somewhere else.

15 Q. Was it upper Manhattan or somewhere  
16 else?

17 A. I don't remember.

18 Q. How many times did you go to this  
19 other doctor?

20 A. The first time for the evaluation and  
21 the second time for the injections.

22 Q. Are you on the same schedule as your  
23 husband, where you're scheduled to get three?

24 A. Different times, the same day.

25 Q. Basically, you are going to get three

1 M. Ali

2 and you've had one so far?

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. Did that first injection have any  
5 affect on the level of pain?

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. How would you describe that?

8 A. It feels more constant. The pain is  
9 more constant.

10 Q. Did the injections make you feel  
11 better or worse or the same?

12 A. Not make me feel worse, but I noticed  
13 it was more often.

14 MR. MAYER: You noticed what was  
15 more often, the pain?

16 THE WITNESS: The amount of  
17 times.

18 MR. MAYER: Amount of what?

19 Q. Take your time.

20 THE WITNESS: The amount, how  
21 many times a day.

22 MR. MAYER: How many times a day  
23 what you feel?

24 THE WITNESS: More often.

25 MR. MAYER: Okay.

1 M. Ali

2 Q. This injection that you had to your  
3 lower back, did you feel better after you had  
4 it or worse or the same or something else, in  
5 some other words you want to describe it?

6 A. After the infection?

7 Q. I mean the injection. Do you think  
8 the injection had an affect on you?

9 A. I don't know.

10 Q. This doctor that you went to that  
11 evaluated you, what did he tell you the  
12 injection was going to do for you?

13 A. Helps with the pain, ease the pain or  
14 it might take it away.

15 Q. After you had that injection, did you  
16 ever tell the doctor how it went, how you  
17 felt?

18 A. No.

19 Q. Do you have a date scheduled for the  
20 next two?

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. What are those dates?

23 A. I don't know.

24 Q. Is it something like a week from now?

25 A. Yes.

1 M. Ali

2 Q. Then, another two weeks after that?

3 A. Yeah, yeah.

4 Q. Did you ever fill out any  
5 questionnaires with this doctor, written  
6 questionnaires, where you had to sign or  
7 anything like that?

8 A. I don't remember.

9 Q. Did anybody recommend any injections  
10 to your neck?

11 A. No.

12 Q. Have you had any injections to your  
13 neck?

14 A. No.

15 Q. Has any doctor recommended surgery for  
16 your neck or your back since the accident of  
17 October 28, 2006?

18 A. No.

19 Q. Have you had any surgeries since the  
20 accident?

21 A. No.

22 Q. Ma'am, if you know, did you have  
23 health insurance through your husband's  
24 employment at the time of this accident?

25 A. No.

1 M. Ali

2 Q. Did you have your own health  
3 insurance?

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. Who did you have health insurance  
6 with?

7 A. Medicaid and Affinity.

8 Q. Medicaid and --

9 A. Affinity.

10 Q. What is Affinity?

11 A. That is another health insurance.

12 MR. MORRIS: A-F-F-I-N-I-T-Y.

13 Q. Did you have any health insurance from  
14 a prior employment?

15 A. No.

16 Q. Ma'am, did you ever injure your neck  
17 or back before the accident of October 28,  
18 2006?

19 A. No.

20 Q. After this accident of October 28,  
21 2006, did you ever reinjure your neck or your  
22 back?

23 A. No.

24 Q. Ma'am, is there any other medical  
25 examination, treatment or care that you have

1 M. Ali

2 received in connection with this accident,  
3 besides what you've testified to?

4 A. No.

5 Q. Just for clarification, we had an  
6 emergency room visit at New York Presbyterian  
7 on the day of the accident?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. Followed by Castle Hill?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. Then, Castle Hill sent you to Dr.  
12 Merola?

13 A. Castle Hill didn't send me.

14 Q. Okay. How did you come to use Dr.  
15 Merola's services?

16 A. My husband.

17 Q. Then, how many visits, all together,  
18 did you make to Dr. Merola?

19 A. I don't know.

20 Q. Do you think it was the same number of  
21 visits that your husband made?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. Do you know Dr. Merola's first name?

24 A. No.

25 Q. Is that a man or woman?

1 M. Ali

2 A. A man.

3 Q. Before this accident, who took care of  
4 the children before this accident?

5 A. I.

6 Q. By yourself, basically?

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. Did you need any help from any other  
9 family members to help you raising your  
10 children?

11 A. Before the accident?

12 Q. Yes.

13 A. No, I didn't need any help.

14 Q. So, you took care of your children and  
15 you also attended to your home; is that  
16 correct?

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. Since the accident of October 28,  
19 2006, have you received any help from family,  
20 friends relatives, with your household  
21 chores, including taking care of your  
22 children?

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. Who has helped you?

25 A. My mother-in-law.



1 M. Ali

2 Q. What is your mother-in-law's name?

3 A. Sharmin Ali.

4 Q. Could you spell that first name?

5 A. S-H-A-R-M-I-N.

6 Q. How old is Sharmin about?

7 A. I don't know.

8 Q. Maybe in her 60s?

9 A. Around.

10 Q. What about your husband's father, what  
11 is his name?

12 A. Hamzaad, H-A-M-Z-A-A-D.

13 Q. Hamzaad Ali?

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. About how old is he? The same age --

16 A. About.

17 Q. -- as your husband's mother?

18 A. About.

19 Q. Did anyone else help you, besides your  
20 mother-in-law, after this accident around the  
21 house and raising your children?

22 A. No.

23 Q. Did you have to compensate her  
24 financially in anyway for this help?

25 A. Yes.